Jesse Alloy (jsa3qy)

PROOF: Which came first, the chicken or the egg?

Argument Conclusion: The egg.

Definitions:

<u>Chicken Definition</u>: a domestic fowl kept for its eggs or meat, especially a young one. Further characteristics which define the various breeds of chickens and/or chickens in general can be found here.

<u>Egg Definition</u>: an oval or round object laid by a female bird, reptile, fish, or invertebrate, usually containing a developing embryo. The eggs of birds are enclosed in a chalky shell, while those of reptiles are in a leathery membrane. (Source: Oxford Dictionary of English)

<u>Species Definition</u>: A group of closely related organisms that are very similar to each other and are usually capable of interbreeding and producing fertile offspring.

(Source: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/Species+(biology))

<u>Evolution Definition</u>: Change in the genetic composition of a population during successive generations, often resulting in the development of new species. The mechanisms of evolution include natural selection acting on the genetic variation among individuals, mutation, migration, and genetic drift.

(Source: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/evolution)

Axiom #1

When genetic mutations occur in the non-somatic cells (sex cells) of a species member, offspring may acquire genetic traits different from those belonging to its mother or father.

Axiom #2

Genetic traits resulting from mutation may or may not manifest physically* once an embryo has developed.

Axiom #3

If a sufficient number of genetic mutations lead to physically manifested* new genetic traits, then a member of a species may be considered a member of a new species all together.

Axiom #4

Chickens lay eggs.

Axiom #5

At some point there were no chickens in existence.

Axiom #6

There are chickens in existence now.

Axiom #7

Evolution & Natural Selection is the method by which species develop and diverge.

^{*}physically manifested: manifested in some way beyond the structure of the organism's DNA

ARGUMENT:

Premise 1:

Eggs can have different physical traits to their parents.

Proof: Axiom #1, Axiom #2

Premise 2:

Given enough different physical traits, an organism coming from an egg may be considered not a member of its parents' species.

Proof: Axiom #3

Premise 3:

Therefore, there was a chicken which was the first to have all of the traits which characterize a chicken.

Proof: premise 2, Axiom #5, Axiom #6, Axiom #7

Premise 4:

This chicken came from an egg, and the cells in this egg had the same DNA as the adult chicken's cells.

Proof: Definition of an Egg and Chicken (and embryo, indirectly)

Premise 5:

The parents of this first chicken egg did not need to be chickens themselves.

Proof: Axiom #1, Axiom #3

Conclusion:

Therefore, there existed an egg whose parents' genomes did not consist of genes which yield physically manifested traits which characterize a chicken (while the egg's genome did). Therefore, there existed an egg which was a chicken egg even though its parents were not themselves chickens. Thus the chicken egg had to come first, before the chicken itself.

Objection Addressed:

One may object that speciation is subjective, so they may consider what I call the "first" chicken's mother to be a chicken as well. However, a response is that the argument still holds given there is a mother of a chicken at some point in time that can be considered to be not a chicken by that person. That organism's egg would be the first chicken egg.

In other words, for different definitions of what makes or does not make a chicken will lead to defining a different egg as the "first," but nonetheless there exists a first egg for which there was no chicken before it.